

# Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes

## March 14, 2019

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3pm ET on March 14, 2019.

### Attendees

Cihan Colakoglu (Kyocera Document Solutions)  
Smith Kennedy (HP)  
Jeremy Leber (Lexmark)  
Ira McDonald (High North)  
Chris Rizzo (Xerox)  
Bill Wagner (TIC)  
Uli Wehner (Ricoh)  
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

### Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
  - [http://www.pwg.org/chair/membership\\_docs/pwg-ip-policy.pdf](http://www.pwg.org/chair/membership_docs/pwg-ip-policy.pdf)
  - IP policy accepted, Smith taking minutes
2. Approve IPP minutes from previous meetings
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20190228.pdf>
  - Approved? YES
  - Paul got a listing for the concrete/mortar standards, Mike replied, more discussion needed
  - Paul working with ISTO on creating the liaison between PWG and WG 12 as a non-voting member to allow access
  - Smith meeting with Alexander Oster (Autodesk / informal 3MF Consortium liaison to PWG) on 3/15, they may be close to signing and are interested in joint PR release
3. Status/Review of various IPP mailing list notes
  - W3C approves WebAuthn (Mike)
    - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/019945.html>
    - Should possibly add this to IPP Authentication Methods? Smith to ask Mike on reflector
  - IPP Everywhere PWG-Raster and PDF Requirement (Sean Kau)
    - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/019948.html>
    - PWG Raster as a base that all support
    - Fall back to PWG Raster if one or the other doesn't support it, or if there is a print failure with PDF (as seen in the CUPS ipp backend)
  - RFC: DEPRECATED and OBSOLETE definitions (Mike)
    - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/019958.html>
    - Proposed definitions by Mike Sweet; Ira seconded them

- NIST Threshold Cryptography Workshop 2019: Live Webcast (Ira)
  - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/019959.html>
  - Ira watched it and said it was really fascinating and well done
  - Will be available for replay via YouTube
  - Multi-party encryption with cool ability to kick out one of the parties
- NISTIR 8214: Final Publication and Public Comments
  - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/019966.html>
  - Threshold schemes for cryptographic primitives
  - Notion of standardizing the primitives rather than the protocols
- RFC: job-history-interval-configured/-supported Printer Description attributes (Mike)
  - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/019968.html>
  - Proposed by Mike Sweet; no objections
- FYI: IRTF Privacy Enhancements and Assessments Proposed Research Group (PEARG) (Ira)
  - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/019985.html>
- 4. Status of AMSC and ISO liaisons w/ PWG (Paul)
  - In process, Paul working with ISTO on liaison between ICITS and ISTO
- 5. LCRC Review of IPP Authentication Methods (Smith)
  - Lots of changes in latest revision
- 6. Status of Safe G-Code (Mike)
  - In process
- 7. Status of IPP 3D Printing Extensions v1.1 (Mike)
  - In process
- 8. Status of IPP Everywhere 1.1 (Mike)
  - Deferring PWG Last Call until working drafts and beta tools are available (probably Q2)
- 9. Status of IPP Everywhere 1.1 Self-Certification Manual 1.1 (Mike)
  - Deferring PWG Last Call until working drafts and beta tools are available (probably Q2)
- 10. Status of IPP System Service (Ira/Mike)
  - Mike has been working on prototyping in ippserver
  - Issues are being tracked in GitHub "ippsample" project
- 11. Status of PWG MFD Alerts 1.1 (Ira)
  - In process
- 12. Status of IPP Document Object v1.1 (Mike)
  - Prototyping going on
  - Need to add "Deprecated" and "Obsolete" definitions
  - Will be PWG Call for Objections because it is a 1.1 (errata update) but should it be a 2.0?
- 13. Review of IPP Job Extensions v1.1 (Mike)
  - Prototyping going on
  - Need to add "Deprecated" and "Obsolete" definitions
  - What to do about versioning? 1.1 or 2.0? (Email thread)
    - What is the cost? Approval process is longer with 2.0; no other real costs
    - Consensus is to label it as 2.0 and have it travel through the longer

approval process

14. Status of IPP Enterprise Printing Extensions v2.0 (formerly JPS2) (Smith)
  - Smith working on first draft (nearly done, still cleaning up and negotiating)
  - Smith sent email to discuss what gets kept, what gets obsoleted, what gets moved to other specs (IPP Job Extensions v2.0)
  - Perhaps we need to cross-reference these attributes with IPP/2.0, IPP/2.1 and IPP/2.2 and use that to guide whether the attributes should be in Job Extensions 2.0 vs. IPP Enterprise Printing Extensions 1.0
  - discussed job-retain-until and job-retain-until-time and job-retain-until-date
    - consensus was to keep job-retain-until (type2 keyword) and job-retain-until-interval (integer(0:MAX))
      - Semantics for job-retain-until-interval could be specified that the integer is the number of seconds, etc. once it has entered its terminal state (e.g. calculated as "date-time-at-completed" + "job-retain-until-interval").
    - what to do about "job-password" Jobs that the Job isn't a Retained Job
  - "job-password" should be disallowed when "job-retain-until" or "job-retain-until-interval" are specified
  - maybe the better recommendation for a "secure print" that doesn't get aged out is to use "job-print-password" and have it be "save-only"?
    - Should there be additional dispositions?
15. Status of IPP Encrypted Jobs and Documents (Mike)
  - Looking at Q3
16. Next steps
  - Please attend the F2F in Lexington!

## Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next conference calls on March 28 and April 11, 2019 at 3pm ET
  - Mike will not be able to call in!
- Lexington F2F meetings on April 17 and 18, 2019
  - <https://www.pwg.org/chair/meeting-info/april-2019-lexington.html>
- Action: Mike to start PWG Call for Objections of IPP 3D v1.1 ending March 28th (DONE)
- Action: Mike to start IPP WG Last Call of MFD Alerts 1.1 ending March 14th (DONE)
- Action: Mike to add DEPRECATED and OBSOLETE terms to other errata documents (DONE)
- Action: Mike to post updated document templates (DONE)
- Action: Smith to follow-up on the 3MF liaison agreement (IN PROGRESS - meeting with 3MF liaison on 3/15)