

IDS Face-to-Face Minutes

December 8, 2011

Meeting was called to order at approximately 1:15pm local December 8, 2011.

Attendees

Jacob Brown (Dell)
Ira McDonald (High North/Samsung - call in)
Joe Murdock (Sharp)
Glen Petrie (Epson - call in)
Brian Smithson (Ricoh - call in)
Michael Sweet (Apple)
Jerry Thrasher (Lexmark)
Randy Turner (Amalfi - call in)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
 - a. Policy accepted with Mike taking the minutes
2. Approved the non-existent minutes from the previous concall
3. Action items
 - a. 117 (Brian Smithson): mark as completed, Brian posting copy during meeting
4. IDS Attributes
 - a. Code 1:
 - Change AttributesNaturalLanguage to just "NaturalLanguage"
 - Don't bind to NaturalLanguageConfigured, just provide an implementation note that it may come from that element, from the requested language (e.g. IPP), etc.
 - Also add notes about the dangers of changing the natural language when re-evaluating the status of a device (i.e. change control to German and everything comes back in German instead of English)
5. IDS-ATTR
 - a. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/wd-idsattributes10-20111204.pdf>
 - b. Section 4.1: Explain "code" header as the decimal value assigned in the PWG registry for these attributes.
 - c. Global: add captions to all tables.
 - d. Figure out a way to list attributes (or groups of attributes) in the table of contents.
 - e. Add RFC 5646 normative reference for language tags
 - f. Make section 9 (References), 9.1 (Normative References), and 9.2 (Informative References)
 - g. DefaultPasswordEnabled: Clarify semantics to reflect that the value is false if ALL default passwords are disabled and true otherwise (in the case of multiple default passwords)
 - h. ForwardingEnabled: Sync up with IETF definition to reflect that the value is true if forwarding or bridging between ANY interface is enabled and false otherwise.
 - i. Add limits for string attribute lengths
 - Adopt IPP/SM limits as appropriate
 - Upper limit is 32767 for strings and 1023 for URIs in IPP
6. IDS-NAP
 - a. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/wd-ids-napsoh10-20111204.pdf>
 - b. Fix conformance of UserApplicationEnabled/PersistenceEnabled: Should be mandatory
 - c. Style: "decimal (0xHEX)" or "0xHEX (decimal)"? Joe will check the NAP specs
 - Microsoft uses decimal for TLV indexes and hex for values
 - TNC uses "0xHEX (decimal)"
 - Source spec "rules" - stick with current style ("decimal (0xHEX)") for TLVs plus hex representations for all values
 - Ira will keep TNC binding consistent with TNC style
 - d. DefaultPasswordEnabled: make sure the semantics reflect that the value is false if ALL default passwords are disabled and true otherwise
 - e. Fix change history (search/replace change affected change log)

- f. Move section 6.2 someplace else (not in our conformance section)
7. TNC/NEA
- a. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/wd-ids-tnc10-20111205-rev.pdf>
 - b. Action: Mike to change template abstract to use the word "document" instead of "standard".
 - c. Page 19: Need to document which (required) attributes need the NOSKIP flag set, such as "NaturalLanguage".
 - d. Section 5.1.1: Update name
 - e. Line 646: "the name of the manufacturer OF this device" (missing word)
 - f. Section 5.1.4:
 - Line 664: "decimal 12 plus 3 for the length of the attribute value"
 - Line 665-666: 24-bits, no padding
 - g. Issue: DefaultPasswordEnabled vs. TCG FactoryDefaultPasswordEnabled
 - Do we define our own in parallel or reference TCG property?
 - Using TCG will scatter some properties throughout the various types
 - Also may introduce additional requirements/dependencies to use the TCG properties
 - Consensus is to simply reference TCG properties (SHOULD be consistent with TCG ...) and still have our own copy
 - h. Section 5/5.1: Add some notes about the coding decisions that follow style from TCG (e.g. booleans are 32-bits, variable-length strings, etc.)
 - i. Add note to be careful about protocol mapping of firewall rules (e.g. to SM)
 - j. Section 5.1.9: Say "from oldest to newest" in description on 752-753, just like for the value description.
 - k. FirmwarePatches:
 - Isn't there a TCG property?
 - How to represent multiple values and/or extend a value?
 - If a single value, define encoding/escaping since the abstract attribute is an array of values
 - Similar issues for application attributes
 - l. Line 799: "must BE deleted" (missing word)
8. IDS-IAA
- a. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/schema/12-2011/PwgSecurity.wsdl>
 - b. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/schema/12-2011/PwgSecurityOpMsg.xsd>
 - c. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/schema/12-2011/Security.xsd>
 - d. Need to separate the encryption and hash WKVs
 - e. May want to talk about negotiation policies/strategies for printers and clients (protocol negotiation, authentication, etc.)
 - f. Rolls:
 - end-user -> EndUser
 - Normal (P2600) vs. User (IPP/SM) vs. EndUser (IPP/SM)
 - Probably want to combine as just User
 - Add "Guest" or "Anonymous"?
 - Identity may be provided but no authentication
 - Add "AuthenticatedGuest"?
 - Authenticates but is a guest/visitor/contractor with less privileges than "User"
 - Need to clearly define it; do we just use GroupMember?
 - P2600 limits role definition to the kinds of things can be done
 - Change "JobOwner" to "Owner" (owner of object for the operation/policy)
 - Add "System" role?
 - Other Printer MIB Roles:
 - System Manager
 - Help Desk
 - Asset Manager
 - Accountant

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next conference call January 19, 2012 at 1pm Eastern Time
- Debate user roles
- Post updates of all documents
- Action: Mike to change template abstract to use the word "document" instead of "standard".