

IDS Face-to-Face Minutes

May 15, 2014

Meeting was called to order at approximately 1:00 pm local May 15, 2014.

Attendees –

Russell Brudnicki	Kyocera Document Solutions
Jeremy Leber	Lexmark
Ira McDonald*	High North
Joe Murdock	Sharp
Brian Smithson*	Ricoh
Alan Sukert*	Xerox
Michael Sweet	Apple
Bill Wagner	TIC
Rick Yardumian	Canon

*Dial-in

Agenda Items

Note: Meeting slides are available at ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/Presentation/2014-05-15-IDS_F2F.pdf.

1. Minute Taker
 - a. Alan Sukert taking the minutes
2. Agenda:
 - Introductions, Agenda Review
 - Common Criteria Update
 - Document Status
 - Document Review
 - HCD-TNC Binding (Health Assessment) Spec (Ready for Prototyping)
 - IDS Model Spec (Interim)
 - Schema
 - Future Activities
 - Wrap Up
3. Went through the PWG Intellectual Property policy.
4. Action Item Review:
 - #150 – Still open. Don't have the entire schema yet.
 - #151 – Completed. Will review updates at this meeting.
5. Brian Smithson reviewed the latest status of the new MFP Protection Profile (PP) Technical Committee (TC). The key comments were:
 - Based on feedback from the Working Group we may have an MFP PP Technical Committee session at the August 2014 PWG Face-to-Face meeting, especially because it will be a joint meeting with the OpenPrinter group.
 - The current MFP PP activity will serve as the base for any future collaborative PP (cPP) developed by an international Technical Community (ITC). Right now Japan and Korea are

IDS Face-to-Face Minutes May 15, 2014

planning to propose such an activity in September. Japan has already created a draft Essential Security Requirements document for this proposed cPP.

6. Joe reminded the group that the Call for Objections period for the HCD-Attributes Spec ends this Monday (Sep 19th).

7. Document Review

- HCD-TNC Binding spec for review was available at <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/wd-idstnc10-20140508.pdf>. Ira indicated that these were mostly cosmetic changes, with the big change being at add the 'TCG' prefix to references to the TNC model.

Review Comments presented at the meeting were:

- a. Add a reference to the PT-EAP spec in the Section 10 references.
- b. Spell out 'TCG' the first time it is used in the spec.
- c. Page 35, Lines 1104 & 1108: Change the phrase "...firmware, user applications (if implemented), **and** resident applications..." to be "...firmware, user applications (if implemented), **or** resident applications...".
- d. Page 40, Line 1275: Add the missing ']' to [TNC-ARCH].
- e. Line 1268: Clarify that the definitions presented in Appendix A are taken verbatim from the TNC-ARCH spec.

There was a reminder that this spec is now stable so prototyping is urgently needed to comply with the PWG process and get this spec eventually approved.

- IDS-Model spec for review was available at <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/wd-ids-model10-20140510.pdf>. Joe indicated this was a complete rewrite to eliminate unnecessary material, provide an updated model and address previous review comments.

Review Comments presented at the meeting were:

- a. Page 11, Line 334: Include the [IEEE2600] reference in Section 10.
- b. Page 13: Line 408: Reword Item #4 to make it a design requirement. Add the reworded item #4 listed here to the rationale in Section 3.1.
- c. Page 13, Section 3.5: Add 'support extensibility' as a design requirement.
- d. Page 20, Line 628: Make the [OASIS] reference consistent between the text and Section 10 (see also Comment kk).
- e. Page 20, Section 4.2: Add system and server as Security Actors.
- f. Page 20, Line 643: Revise sentence to read "A client may **be** an autonomous...".
- g. Page 21, Section 4.2.4: Add to the definition of User the concept that a user could be a system account or process in the context of the IDS model.
- h. Section 4: Include the tern 'actor' where appropriate when referring to a type of actor.

During the discussion we agreed that to be considered a Security Object an object had to have an owner.

- i. Page 21: Section 4.3: Add system and client to the list of Security Objects.

IDS Face-to-Face Minutes May 15, 2014

- j. Page 22, Section 4.4.1: Add 'proxy' to the list of User roles.
 - k. Page 23, Table 1:
 - Change the definition of ServiceTechnician to read "A user who is allowed..."
 - Change the 'User' entry to be 'Normal User'.
 - In the definition of User 'hard copy' should be 'hardcopy'.
 - l. General: Consistently use capitalization when referring to terms like 'Imaging'.
 - m. Page 23, Section 4.4.2: Add proxy and directory as Device Roles.
 - n. Page 24, Section 4.4.3: Add client as a Service Role.
 - o. Page 24, Section 4.4.4 table:
 - Change the definition of Computer to be "A stationary general purpose device..."
 - In the definition of Computer 'MAC OS-X' should just be 'OS-X'.
 - A 'laptop' should be included in the definition of Mobile Device, not in the definition of Computer.
 - Change the definition of Server to be 'A computing device that is protected by physical security designed...'
 - Define the acronym 'MFD' used in the Imaging Device table entry.
 - p. Page 24, Section 4.4.5: Add directory services and authentication services to the list of Service Types.
 - q. Page 25, Figure 1: Remove the extra picture.
 - r. Page 25, Section 4.5.1: Retitle the section to be 'Security Owner'.
 - s. Page 26, Figure 2: Update this figure (and the other figures in Section 4.5) to reflect the new actors, security objects and roles added.
 - t. Page 26, Section 4.5.1.1: Make the definition of User Identification more flexible.
 - u. General Comment: Go through the document and make sure there is the proper use of "an" vs. "a".
 - v. Page 27, Section 4.5.1.2: Add 'X.509 Certificates' to the list of Device Identification and Service Identification elements.
 - w. Page 28, Figure 6: Clarify what the 'ServiceLocation' element is.
 - x. General Comment: Use 'MFD' instead of 'MFP' consistently in the document.
 - y. Page 28, Section 4.5.1.4: Add 'CertificateUri' and 'Certificate Hash' to the list of Service Identifications.
- As an aside, it was agreed that Joe will figure out later how to sync the IDS Model spec with the Semantic Model and IPP specs.
- z. Page 30, Figure 7: Remove the old diagram from this figure.
 - aa. Page 33, Section 4.5.4: Modify the definition of 'Negotiated Security' elements to reflect the outcome of the discussion held during the meeting.

IDS Face-to-Face Minutes May 15, 2014

- bb. General Comment: [Pwgxxxx] references should be changed to be [PWGxxxx] references.
- cc. Page 36, Section 6: This section should be retitled "Security Recommendations" because there are only 'SHOULD' in this section. Add a new 'Conformance Requirements' section with any requirements that are defined as the model gets fleshed out more.
- dd. Page 35, Section 6.2: Add the three documents referenced in this new section to the list of referenced documents in Section 10.
- ee. General Comment: Make sure you define and list all terms and acronyms used in the document.
- ff. Page 35, Line 840: Remove the 'PWG 5110.3-2013 -' before the spec name referenced in this line.
- gg. Page 35, Section 6: Add a statement to the effect that 'bindings of the model MUST follow the elements in Section 4 and meet the design requirements in Section 3.5'.
- hh. Page 36, Section 8.1:
 - Lines 860-867: Modify the text to be a separate paragraph with wording as follows "Additionally, an Imaging Device SHOULD support" and then add the two bullets. Remove any SHOULDs or MUSTs from the text in the two bullets. Use the Cloud Model spec as a guide.
 - Revise the discussion of the considerations of user data to reflect the outcome of the discussion held during the meeting.
 - Line 852: Fix the grammar of the sentence that starts on this line per the discussion at the meeting. For example, use 'can' instead of 'may' and change '...should be routed' to be '...is to be routed...'.
 - Lines 857-860: Make this text a bullet under Line 861.
- ii. Page 36, Section 9: Update the text to add references to MIB registration and IPP keyword. Use PWG5107.3 as a guide.
- jj. Page 37: Fix the URL in the reference to [PWG5100.12].
- kk. Page 37" Change the [OASIS] reference tag to be [OASIDS-SOS].
- ll. Section 10: When done sort the references alphabetically.
- Schema for review was available at <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/schema/Security.xsd>.
There were no comments presented at the meeting.

Next Steps

- Next Conference Call Jun 2, 2014 at 11am PT/ 2 pm ET.
- Next Face-to-Face Meeting will be Aug 12-15 in Toronto Canada (Joint PWG-OpenPrinting meeting).
- Actions:
 - a. Ira: Update the HCD-TNC Binding spec to address the comments presented at this meeting.
 - b. Joe: Update the IDS-Model spec to address the comments presented at this meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:20 PM local on May 15, 2014.