

PWG WIMS

Conference Call Minutes

February 23, 2012

W.A. Wagner, CoChairman PWG WIMS/PMP

1 Attendees

Ira McDonald	High North/Samsung
Glen Petrie	Epson
Bill Wagner	TIC
Rick Yardumian	Canon

2 General

- Meeting was convened at 1 PM EST, February 23, 2012 and ended about 2:01 PM EST
- Notice was made that the meeting was held in accord with the PWG Intellectual Property Policy. There were no objections.
- Minutes of the February Face-to-face meeting (<ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/wims/minutes/wims-f2f-minutes-20120209.pdf>) were accepted without comment
- Bill Wagner agreed to take minutes.

3 Action Items Review

The action items listed in the previous meeting minutes were discussed

- Mike to re-post notice of prototyping for IPP printer-alert and printer-state-reasons values-
 - This notice has been posted.
 - It was observed that, in the past, even a partial prototype was considered adequate for advancing a specification to the Stable state.
 - Furthermore, since this specification adds new values to already existing structures but does not involve defining a complex new structure, and the prototyping of thee additional values in a IPP context has been noted, a specific report of prototyping the addition of these values in a MIB PrtAlert context was not necessary to allow the specification to advance to Stable. There was no objection to this conclusion.
- Mike to post call for MIB Notes Wiki page content to PWG-announce (open)
- Bill to add note to MIB Notes Wiki page about SNMP walks waking up devices to higher power state (open)
- Ira to provide update for MFD Alerts document; Done – see <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/pmp/wd/wd-pmpmfdalerts10-20120223.pdf>

4 MFD Alerts Document Review

- Ira went over the updates to the MFD Alerts document (<ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/pmp/wd/wd-pmpmfdalerts10-20120223-rev.pdf>) in detail, correlating his changes with the notes from the February face-to-face review. Comments were:
 - Squeeze Table 2 so that last row does not advance to new page
 - Address blank widow at the end of section 6.4.
- Ira suggested that he might add an informational section dealing with ensuring a reasonable relationship between columns of the Alerts Table and potentially proper handling of the table itself. It was agreed that:
 - Such information would apply to the prtAlert table as a whole and not just to the additional entries defined in this specification.

- In this specification, compliance with such instruction could not reasonably be made mandatory for compliance
 - Such an addition would delay presenting this specification for PWG last call and vote.
- However, it was agreed that proper documentation of these issues in prtAlert Table implementation was desirable and should, at some point, be in a formal PWG document with specified compliance requirements. It was suggested that:
 - Ira would generate an informational section that would be entered in the MIB Notes Wiki page, where it would be reviewed and potentially added to.
 - Following the assembly and discussion of these and related MIB issues, WIMS would initiate a project to create a formal PWG document including these issues and solutions (and possibly other matters) pertaining to the Printer MIB.
- Further, it was agreed, as considered above, that there was sufficient prototype notice to bring the MFD Alerts specification to Stable and to proceed with working group last call.
 - Considering the multitude of specifications going for PWG last call and ballot in the April-May timeframe, it is desirable to accelerate the cycle on this simple specification.
 - Therefore, Ira will provide an updated version and we will proceed with working group last call in tey next week
 - We will request dispensation from the steering committee to complete PWG last call and last call resolution and to start ballot prior to the April Plenary meeting.

5 Power MIB Interop

There was no information on activity in the PWG Power MIB Interop. It was suggested that confusion between the PWG Power MIB and the IETF eman activity may be causing some companies to hold off implementation or even investigation of the PWG Power MIB.

- This potential perhaps is in line with Randy Turner's contention that a comparison/mapping document relating the two efforts be generated
- Ira indicated that he was aware of several companies that were indeed implementing the PWG Power MIB, and that perhaps the lack of response to the interop was a result of business considerations.

The interop will be left open indefinitely, to be terminated at such time as there are sufficient responses or a clear conclusion of no interest.

6 Approach to Correlation of PWG Power MIB to EMAN activities

Bill Wagner indicated that he was working on a preliminary draft.

- At this point, this is proposed as an informal working draft within the WIMS group, probably going to a white paper as more contributions and comments come in
- The initial draft will concentrate on the charter of the eman group vs the project charter of the PWG Power effort, pointing out the distinct difference in purpose of the two activities. This will be supported by referring to specific elements representing the limited area of non-conflicting overlap as well as the elements reflecting the different basic intent.
- Ira offered to generate a cross-mapping of overlap areas

7 Action Items

- Next meeting : March 8, 2012
- Mike to post call for MIB Notes Wiki page content to PWG-announce (open)
- Bill to organize MIB Notes Wiki page, provide links in other pages, and add a note about SNMP walks waking up devices to higher power state (open)
- Ira to provide update for MFD Alerts document
- Bill to provide informal draft of PWG Power MIB/EMAN relationship