**Semantic Model WG Face-to-Face Minutes**

**December 5, 2012**

Peter Zehler called the meeting to order at approximately 3:20 PST on December 5, 2012, in his last time as chair of the SM WG. We all thank Peter for his long and fruitful leadership in the PWG.

The SM WG meeting followed the Cloud Model WG session, at which the additional operations proposed by the SM WG for handling Cloud Printing were discussed. These minutes therefore reference the minutes for that Cloud Model WG session, accessible at <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/cloud/minutes/cloud-f2f-minutes-20121205.pdf>.

**Attendees**

Russ Brudnicki (Kyocera)

Nancy Chen (Oki Data)

Matthew Hansen (Toshiba)

Adam Just (Samsung)

Constantinos Kardamilas (Samsung APS)

Smith Kennedy (HP, call in)

Kelly Lucas (Google)

Daniel Manchala (Xerox)

Ira McDonald (High North, call in)

Joe Murdock (Sharp )

Ron Nevo (Samsung)

Glen Petrie (Epson, call in)

Brian Smithson (Ricoh)

Alan Sukert (Xerox, call in)

Mike Sweet (Apple, call in)

Randy Turner (Amalfi)

Paul Tykodi (TCS, call in)

Larry Upthegrove (individual, call in)

Bill Wagner (TIC)

Rick Yardumian (Canon)

Peter Zehler (Xerox, call in)

**Administrative Items**

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker

a. Policy accepted implicitly from agreement in preceding meetings

b. Bill Wagner agreed to take minutes

2. Transition of Semantic Model WG

a. Confirmation that Daniel Manchala will be taking over Pete's role in Xerox with respect to the PWG, SM working group projects and schema, and to be chair of the Semantic Model working group.

b. Confirmation that Paul Tykodi would act as Vice Chair during the development of the Transformer Service specification. The duration of that development was not stated.

c. There is need for a permanent Vice Chair and a Secretary, as well as editors to support Daniel and the significant number of projects identified for the SM WG.

3. Previous Action Items

a. Pete to verify that the original evolution and namespace registry documents are posted on the PWG server -OPEN

b. Ira to update SM charter to add mapping specs and merge SM/MFD charters - OPEN

c. Bill to update Cloud charter to remove mapping specs - DONE

d. Pete to send Daniel's info to Jerry to add him to the SC list -?

**Specification Status**

1. **Transform Service**
   1. Current Posted Version**:** [**ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/mfd/wd/wd-mfdtransformmodel01-20120807.pdf**](ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/mfd/wd/wd-mfdtransformmodel01-20120807.pdf)
   2. Need to finish up use cases and requirements sections before we can go to prototype.
   3. Paul needs help with handling of use cases.
   4. Conference call set for 10 December at 4PM EST to discuss Transform Service use cases
   5. ACTION ITEM: Paul T. to send message to MDF list outlining the situation and his objectives for the 10 December conference call.
2. **PWG Semantic Model Schema**
   1. Errors observed
      1. CharsetSupported not properly encoded as a list of keyword.
      2. NaturalLanguageSupported not properly encoded as a list of keyword.
      3. FinishingCol is the wrong type.
      4. For consistency with IPP implementations, every member within a processing element’s complex type should be decorated with the MustHonor attribute rather than just have the complex type inherit the attribute and have the value applicable to all constituent members
   2. Resolution
      1. ACTION ITEM: Daniel will correct namespace and schema with respect to issues identified above
      2. Errors are not reflected in approved standards, except that reference to Schema version in PWG Job Ticket standard must be corrected using Errata mechanism. ACTION ITEM: Daniel (or delegated person) to issue errata as identified in the PWG process document section 9.1.
3. **Cloud Print Operations**
   1. Modifications to WDSL: ACTION ITEM: Peter will implement changes to WSDL as agreed in Cloud WG session
   2. Name Changes: ACTION ITEM: Peter will add “Print Service” to operations as necessary to properly distinguish object of operation. With changes made, operations are now named:
      1. AcknowledgePrintDocument
      2. AcknowledgePrintJob
      3. FetchPrintDocument
      4. FetchPrintJob
      5. GetFetchablePrintJobs
      6. UpdateFetchablePrintJobs
      7. UpdatePrintDocumentState
      8. UpdatePrintJobState
      9. UpdatePrintServiceState
   3. As agreed in Cloud Model WG session, an IPP notifications mechanism should be available for Cloud Printing. ACTION ITEM: Create/check a WSDL file identifying all Notification Operations to be used in conjunction with Print Operations. Ensure GetNotifications properly reflects applicable parts of RFC3995, 3996, 3997.
4. PWG Job Ticket Specification
   1. Glen observed some problems in the approved text. ACTION ITEM: Glen to send message to MFD list identifying errors and suggesting corrections.
5. MSPS –PWG PJT Mapping
   1. Status : Current version as white paper at <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/mfd/white/msps-mapping-20121205.pdf> .Paul suggests mapping is 80-90% done.
   2. Agreement that Job and Document Level elements correlate. Paul had question on handling of MSPS page level elements. IPP (PWG SM) page override operations to be used for mapping. Comment that PWG page override requires explicit statement of the values of all media collection elements, including those that are unchanged.
   3. General discussion of elements that exist in PWG or MSPS and do not appear to map in the alternate system. In such cases, mapping table will represent an element in one side but not other. Text explanation is necessary only when mapping exists but is not 1:1.
   4. Observation that there will be instances where the path to the lowest element may vary, but the element and its values may still match well with a similar terminal element in the other system.
6. V1 of Mapping Document
   1. MSPS to PWG mapping format follows that used for JPS mapping.
   2. ACTION ITEM: Mike to rework PPD mapping information into similar format
   3. ACTION ITEM: Schedule for V1 of Mapping document should be reviewed for inclusion in updated charter.

**Next Steps / Open Actions**

* Next conference call December 10, 2012 at 4pm (EST)
* Subsequent conference calls to alternate with IDS on Mondays, starting 2PM EST on 14 January.
* ACTION ITEMS:
  + ACTION ITEM: Ira et al. to update SM charter to add mapping specs and merge SM/MFD charters - OPEN
  + ACTION ITEM: Paul T. to send message to MDF list outlining the situation and his objectives for the 10 December conference call
  + ACTION ITEM: Daniel (or delegated person) to issue errata as identified in the PWG process document section 9.1.
  + ACTION ITEM: Peter will implement changes to WSDL as agreed in Cloud WG session
  + ACTION ITEM: Peter will add “Print Service” to operations as necessary to properly distinguish object of operation.
  + ACTION ITEM: Create/check a WSDL file identifying all Notification Operations to be used in conjunction with Print Operations. Ensure GetNotifications properly reflects applicable part sof RFC3995, 3996, 3997.
  + ACTION ITEM: Glen to send message to MFD list identifying errors and suggesting corrections.
  + ACTION ITEM: Mike to rework PPD mapping information into similar format
  + ACTION ITEM: Schedule for V1 of Mapping document should be reviewed for inclusion in updated charter.

Bill Wagner, 6 Dec 2012