

IPPV2 Working Group

2009-04-27 Face-to-Face Meeting Minutes

1. Attendees

Michael Sweet*	Apple
Lee Farrell	Canon
Glen Petrie*	Epson
Harry Lewis	InfoPrint
Ira McDonald*	High North
Jerry Thrasher	Lexmark
Dave Whitehead	Lexmark
Nancy Chen	Oki Data
Joe Murdock	Sharp
Bill Wagner	TIC
Paul Tykodi	Tykodi Consulting
Pete Zehler	Xerox

* via telephone

Ira McDonald opened the IDS session and provided the planned agenda:

- Introductions, Minute Takers, Agenda Review
- IPP/2.0 Review and Discussion
- IPP PSX Review and Discussion
- Action Items and Next Steps

2. Minutes Taker

Lee Farrell

3. PWG Operational Policy

It was noted that all attendees should be aware that the meeting is conducted under the PWG Membership and Intellectual Property rules. There were no objections.

4. IPP/2.0 Review and Discussion

Ira led a page-by-page review of the IPPv2.0 specification, which has been out for a PWG Last Call comment period scheduled to end on May 4.

Ira indicated that the conformance level definitions in Section 2 Terminology are not sufficiently concise for a normative section. He suggested that the definition should be reduced to a reference to the following normative sections. It was generally felt that the content of Section 2 should be re-written—not as normative “terms”, but as an informative guideline.

There was some question about whether Section 3 should be labeled “Informative.” After some discussion—noting that it contains some normative requirements, it was agreed that the word “(Informative)” will be removed.

IPPV2 Working Group

2009-04-27 Face-to-Face Meeting Minutes

It was noted that at the end of Section 4 there is a note to the PWG Secretary which should be removed.

There was a discussion about the value of Validate-Job and whether it should be an optional operation. Michael Sweet indicated that it is useful for Production Printing.

It was pointed out that Validate-Job has been a required operation for IPPv1.1—although most clients don't use it, and many implementations have not implemented it well.

In conclusion, the group agreed that IPPv2.0 should be changed to downgrade Validate-Job to "Optional". It will remain "Required" in IPPv2.1.

Pete clarified that Validate-Job is really intended to validate the parameters that are being set in a Create Job operation. It is *not* intended to validate the PDL, and no ripping is involved.

It was suggested that a footnote should be added to provide the justification of why Validate-Job was made Optional. A separate footnote should be added to explain the intended purpose of the operation—and that it could have been more aptly named "Validate-Job-Ticket" (or something similar.)

The decision about what to do with the Validate-Job Operation in IPPv2.2 was deferred, although Ira suggested that it should at least be "Recommended" for IPPv2.2.

The group agreed that the tables should be given Table numbers with captions. Also, the formatting of the Tables (double-lines, etc.) should be made consistent.

The table in Section 6.2 has some blank rows in it. The Editor needs to confirm whether there was some intended content for these rows or whether they are just superfluous entries. Evidently, the attributes orientation-requested and orientation-requested-default were deleted, but should not have been.

The Notes at the bottom of page 14 should reference "IPP/2.x", not "IPP/2.0".

Should media-col-ready be included? It was agreed that a footnote should be added to explain why media-col-ready was omitted. (It is impractical for spoolers.)

There should be a note added below Table 6.3 for the PWG Secretary to resolve the document numbers in "PWG510x.y".

The text color in Sections 7.3 and 7.4 should be corrected from gray to black.

Some of the text in Section 7.3 should be moved to a new section 7.4 called "IPP over TLS".

The existing Section 7.4 should change the second "(a)" and "(b)" to "(c)" and "(d)."

The e-mail address for Harry Lewis needs to be updated to "harry.lewis@infoprint.com".

IPPV2 Working Group

2009-04-27 Face-to-Face Meeting Minutes

ACTION: Ira McDonald (with some Word help from Bill Wagner) will update the IPPv2.0 specification to reflect all the changes agreed to at the April 27 meeting.

ACTION: Harry Lewis will contact Ron Bergman to determine if Ron has an e-mail address that he would like published in the specification.

For the purposes of confirming adequate review of the document by sufficient PWG members, it was noted that there were seven voting individuals in the room and two on the phone—all of which participated in the document review.

Ira (with help from Bill) will publish another updated copy for Last Call.

5. IPP PSX Review and Discussion

Ira led a page-by-page review of the IPP Printer State Extensions v1.0 specification, which has been out for a PWG Last Call comment period scheduled to end on May 4.

Ira noted that Section 5.2 is new.

Line 3090 has a floating period.

There are formatting issues with some of the Headers in the document. Bill volunteered to correct them.

There were no significant comments for necessary changes.

Ira (with help from Bill) will publish another updated copy for Last Call.

ACTION: Ira McDonald (with some Word help from Bill Wagner) will update the IPP PSX specification to reflect all the changes agreed to at the April 27 meeting.

6. Action Items and Next Steps

The planned “Next Steps” for the Working Group were presented:

- IPP/2.0 First Edition
 - * Complete PWG Last Call and revisions
 - * PWG Formal Vote as Candidate Standard
- IPP Printer State Reasons Extensions (PSX)
 - * Complete PWG Last Call and revisions
 - * PWG Formal Vote as Candidate Standard
- IPP Production Printing Set2 – for IPP/2.2
 - * Interim Draft for June PWG face-to-face meeting
- IPP/2.0 Second Edition
 - * Initial draft for Q4 2009 – define IPP/2.2 (production)
 - * Include *all* IETF and PWG IPP extension specs
 - * Clarifications to First Edition and interoperability testing

IPPV2 Working Group

2009-04-27 Face-to-Face Meeting Minutes

7. Next Teleconference

To be announced.

IPPV2 meeting adjourned.