PWG Process 4.0

Status: Stable

Abstract: This document defines the process that guides and controls the work of the Printer Working Group, an organization developing open standards for the Print, Imaging, Multifunction Device, and related service industries.

This document is available electronically at:

<https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/wd/wd-pwg-process-4-20230626.docx>

<https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/wd/wd-pwg-process-4-20230626.pdf>

<https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/wd/wd-pwg-process-4-20230626-rev.docx>

<https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/wd/wd-pwg-process-4-20230626-rev.pdf>

Copyright © 2023 The Printer Working Group. All rights reserved.

Title: *PWG Process 4.0*

The material contained herein is not a license, either expressed or implied, to any IPR owned or controlled by any of the authors or developers of this material or the Printer Working Group. The material contained herein is provided on an “AS IS” basis and to the maximum extent permitted by applicable law, this material is provided AS IS AND WITH ALL FAULTS, and the authors and developers of this material and the Printer Working Group and its members hereby disclaim all warranties and conditions, either expressed, implied or statutory, including, but not limited to, any (if any) implied warranties that the use of the information herein will not infringe any rights or any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose.

Table of Contents

[1. Introduction 5](#_Toc138674921)

[2. Terminology 5](#_Toc138674922)

[2.1 Conformance Terminology 5](#_Toc138674923)

[2.2 Other Terminology 5](#_Toc138674924)

[2.3 Acronyms and Organizations 6](#_Toc138674925)

[3. PWG Document Types 6](#_Toc138674926)

[3.1 PWG Process 6](#_Toc138674927)

[3.2 PWG Policy 6](#_Toc138674928)

[4. PWG Document Development and Approval 7](#_Toc138674929)

[5. PWG Workgroup Decisions 7](#_Toc138674930)

[6. Organization of the PWG 7](#_Toc138674931)

[6.1 PWG Officers 7](#_Toc138674932)

[6.2 PWG Steering Committee 7](#_Toc138674933)

[6.3 PWG Workgroups 8](#_Toc138674934)

[6.4 IETF Designated Experts 8](#_Toc138674935)

[6.5 PWG Members 8](#_Toc138674936)

[6.5.1 Membership Categories 8](#_Toc138674937)

[6.5.2 PWG Voting Members 8](#_Toc138674938)

[7. PWG Meetings 8](#_Toc138674939)

[8. PWG Communications Infrastructure 8](#_Toc138674940)

[9. Publication of PWG Documents 9](#_Toc138674941)

[10. Overview of Changes 9](#_Toc138674942)

[10.1 Process 4.0 9](#_Toc138674943)

[10.2 Process 3.0 9](#_Toc138674944)

[11. References 9](#_Toc138674945)

[11.1 Normative References 9](#_Toc138674946)

[11.2 Informative References 10](#_Toc138674947)

[12. Authors 10](#_Toc138674948)

[13. Change History 10](#_Toc138674949)

[13.1 June 26, 2023 11](#_Toc138674950)

[13.2 May 1, 2023 11](#_Toc138674951)

[13.3 April 10, 2023 11](#_Toc138674952)

[13.4 March 30, 2023 11](#_Toc138674953)

[13.5 March 13, 2023 11](#_Toc138674954)

[13.6 January 9, 2023 11](#_Toc138674955)

[13.7 December 5, 2022 12](#_Toc138674956)

[13.8 November 28, 2022 12](#_Toc138674957)

[13.9 November 8, 2022 12](#_Toc138674958)

[13.10 November 4, 2022 12](#_Toc138674959)

[13.11 August 29, 2022 12](#_Toc138674960)

[13.12 August 23, 2022 13](#_Toc138674961)

[13.13 May 28, 2022 13](#_Toc138674962)

[13.14 May 13, 2022 13](#_Toc138674963)

[13.15 April 12, 2022 13](#_Toc138674964)

[13.16 December 6, 2021 13](#_Toc138674965)

[13.17 November 22, 2021 13](#_Toc138674966)

[13.18 May 24, 2021 13](#_Toc138674967)

[13.19 April 26, 2021 14](#_Toc138674968)

[13.20 March 17, 2021 14](#_Toc138674969)

[13.21 January 6, 2021 14](#_Toc138674970)

1. Introduction

This document defines the composition of the Printer Working Group (PWG), and the processes used to perform the work of the PWG, including:

1. Types of PWG Documents, and the PWG Process and PWG Policy document types;
2. PWG Document development and approval procedures;
3. PWG Workgroup decision making procedures;
4. PWG organization, including PWG Officers, Workgroup Officers, and PWG Membership;
5. PWG Meetings and Workgroup Meetings;
6. PWG Communications Infrastructure; and
7. PWG Document publishing procedures.
8. Terminology
   1. Conformance Terminology

Capitalized terms, such as MUST, MUST NOT, RECOMMENDED, REQUIRED, SHOULD, SHOULD NOT, MAY, and OPTIONAL, have special meaning relating to conformance [BCP14].

* 1. Other Terminology

*Document Editor:* The individual responsible for publishing drafts of a PWG Document incorporating their own work as well as contributions from others. [PWG-ROLES]

*PWG Chair*: Organizes the activities of the PWG and oversees the PWG’s high-level operations. [PWG-ROLES]

*PWG Document*: A document produced by the PWG and approved via one of the PWG's document approval procedures.

*PWG Membership:* The set of individuals and organizations that are members of the PWG.

*PWG Officer:* PWG Chair, PWG Vice-Chair, PWG Secretary.

*PWG Secretary*: Records and distributes the minutes of all PWG plenary sessions and PWG Steering Committee meetings, to support the PWG Chair. [PWG-ROLES]

*PWG Steering Committee*: Oversees the implementation of all PWG procedures and policies. [PWG-ROLES]

*PWG Vice Chair*: Aids the PWG Chair with their duties and fills in for the PWG Chair in cases of absence. [PWG-ROLES]

*PWG Voting Member:* A PWG Member who has a current membership that includes voting rights and that has paid their current membership dues.

*Workgroup*: A PWG development team tasked by the PWG Steering Committee with producing solutions detailed in that Workgroup's Charter.

*Workgroup Officer*: Oversees the activities of a PWG Workgroup. [PWG-ROLES]

* 1. Acronyms and Organizations

*IANA*: Internet Assigned Numbers Authority, <https://www.iana.org/>

*IETF*: Internet Engineering Task Force, <https://www.ietf.org/>

*ISO*: International Organization for Standardization, <https://www.iso.org/>

*PWG*: IEEE ISTO Printer Working Group, <https://www.pwg.org/>

*SC*: PWG Steering Committee

*SDO*: Standards Development Organization

1. PWG Document Types

The PWG Document Management Policy [PWG-DOCS] defines the types of standards and informational PWG Documents developed and published by the PWG. The two exceptions are the PWG Process and PWG Policy document types. The development and adoption procedures for these document types are defined below.

* 1. PWG Process

The PWG Process document defines the fundamental structure and operating procedures of the PWG. The PWG Steering Committee updates the PWG Process. A draft PWG Process document is adopted once it has been approved via the PWG Formal Approval procedure defined in PWG Document Management Policy [PWG-DOCS].

* 1. PWG Policy

A PWG Policy document defines details for a PWG operating procedure not defined in the PWG Process. The PWG Steering Committee creates and updates PWG Policy documents. A draft PWG Policy document is adopted once it has been approved by the PWG Steering Committee.

PWG Policy documents remain in force until the PWG Steering Committee decides that a PWG Policy document is no longer applicable or active, at which time the PWG Policy document status is updated to Obsolete. A PWG Policy document cannot be deprecated for obvious reasons.

1. PWG Document Development and Approval

The PWG Document Management Policy [PWG-DOCS] defines the development stages of a draft PWG Document and defines the procedures for approving a stable draft PWG Document.

1. PWG Workgroup Decisions

The PWG Workgroup Decisions Policy [PWG-WG-DECIDE] defines the procedures used by a PWG Workgroup to approve Workgroup decisions.

1. Organization of the PWG

PWG Roles & Responsibilities [PWG-ROLES] describes in detail the roles below as well as other roles ancillary to the PWG.

* 1. PWG Officers

The PWG Officers are the PWG Chair, PWG Vice-Chair, and PWG Secretary. PWG Roles & Responsibilities [PWG-ROLES] describes their roles and responsibilities in detail.

* 1. PWG Steering Committee

The PWG Steering Committee oversees the implementation of all PWG procedures and policies. The PWG SC is composed of the PWG Officers, all PWG Workgroup Officers, and chairs of inactive PWG Workgroups. PWG Roles & Responsibilities [PWG-ROLES] describes the PWG Steering Committee’s roles and responsibilities in detail.

The PWG Steering Committee can hold confidential meetings and PWG Steering Committee members can communicate confidentially with one another and with outside parties to accomplish PWG governance. The PWG Steering Committee publishes publicly available minutes of PWG Steering Committee meetings without disclosing confidential details.

The PWG Steering Committee approves decisions and documents via consensus based on a simple majority of those voting. Either the PWG Chair or the PWG Vice-Chair must be present for all consensus decisions.

To handle exceptional cases, the Steering Committee MAY decide that one or more of the steps in the PWG Document development procedures can be eliminated or its duration shortened.

* 1. PWG Workgroups

A PWG Workgroup develops PWG Documents. The PWG SC creates a new PWG Workgroup and provides it with a charter. Each PWG Workgroup updates its Workgroup Charter as needed. A PWG Workgroup is active until the PWG SC deactivates it.

Each PWG Workgroup has a Workgroup Chair, a Workgroup Vice-Chair or Workgroup Co-Chair, and a Workgroup Secretary as its leadership officers. PWG Roles & Responsibilities [PWG-ROLES] describes their roles and responsibilities in detail.

* 1. IETF Designated Experts

The PWG depends on Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF) Designated Experts to add, delete, and / or modify entries in IANA registries maintained by the PWG. The PWG Steering Committee ensures continuing IETF Designated Expert support for these registries. PWG Roles & Responsibilities [PWG-ROLES] describes the IETF Designated Experts' roles and responsibilities in detail.

* 1. PWG Members

PWG Members are those organizations or individuals that have paid their current membership dues and agreed to participate and abide by the PWG Membership Agreement [PWG-MEMBERSHIP] as well as this PWG Process 4.0 , PWG Policy on Intellectual Property and Confidentiality [PWG-IP], and PWG Antitrust Policy [PWG-ANTITRUST].

* + 1. Membership Categories

The PWG Membership Policy [PWG-MEMBERS] lists PWG membership categories and their associated voting rights and dues schedule.

* + 1. PWG Voting Members

A PWG Voting Member is a PWG Member [PWG-MEMBERS] who has a current membership level that includes voting rights, and who has paid their current membership dues.

1. PWG Meetings

The PWG Meetings Policy [PWG-MEETINGS] defines the conventions for scheduling and hosting PWG Meetings.

1. PWG Communications Infrastructure

The PWG Communications Policy [PWG-COMM] defines the requirements to support the work of the PWG and its Workgroups, such as Workgroup web pages, mailing lists, and file sharing resources.

1. Publication of PWG Documents

All PWG Documents described in Section 3 "PWG Document Types" MUST be published on the PWG FTP site in either PDF or HTML format, in a durable location with well-known path after achieving the appropriate Last Call and/or Formal Approval, according to the approval methods defined in the PWG Document Management Policy [PWG-DOCS]. The file name of the document MUST follow the conventions defined in PWG Namespace Policy [PWG-NAMING]. The source document used to produce the PDF or HTML MUST also be published in a similar manner and in an appropriate location on the FTP site.

All new drafts made available on the PWG FTP site SHOULD be announced via a notice posted to the relevant Workgroup mailing list(s), as per Workgroup Officer or Steering Committee guidance.

1. Overview of Changes
   1. Process 4.0

PWG Process 4.0 started with Process 3.0 content for inspiration but was otherwise completely rewritten to modernize its structure and focus on the products of the PWG.

* 1. Process 3.0

The PWG Process used since 2009 [PWG-PROCESS-3].

1. References
   1. Normative References

[BCP14] S. Bradner, "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", RFC 2119/BCP 14, March 1997, <https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/bcp14>

[PWG-MEMBERSHIP] Printer Working Group, "PWG Membership Agreement", April 2021, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-membership-agreement-form.pdf>

[PWG-ANTITRUST] Printer Working Group, "PWG Antitrust Policy", April 2021, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-antitrust-policy.pdf>

[PWG-COMM] Printer Working Group, "PWG Communications Policy", May 2023, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-comm-policy.pdf>

[PWG-DOCS] Printer Working Group, "PWG Document Management Policy", May 2023, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-document-management-policy.pdf>

[PWG-IP] Printer Working Group, "The Printer Working Group Policy on Intellectual Property and Confidentiality", January 2009, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-ip-policy.pdf>

[PWG-MEETINGS] Printer Working Group, "PWG Meetings", May 2023, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-meetings-policy.pdf>

[PWG-MEMBERS] Printer Working Group, "PWG Membership Policy", May 2023, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-membership-policy.pdf>

[PWG-NAMING] Printer Working Group, "PWG Namespace Policy", July 2020, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-namespace-policy.txt>

[PWG-ROLES] Printer Working Group, "PWG Roles and Responsibilities", May 2023, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-roles-and-responsibilities-policy.pdf>

[PWG-WG-DECIDE] Printer Working Group, “PWG Workgroup Decisions Policy”, May 2023, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-workgroup-decisions-policy.pdf>

* 1. Informative References

[PWG-PROCESS-3] Printer Working Group, "The Printer Working Group Definition of the Standards Development Process Version 3.0", January 2009, <https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-process30.pdf>

1. Authors

Primary authors:

Smith Kennedy (HP Inc.) - PWG Vice Chair

Jeremy Leber (Lexmark Inc.) - PWG Chair

Ira McDonald (High North Inc.) - PWG Secretary

Alan Sukert - (Individual) - PWG Steering Committee

Bill Wagner - (TIC) - PWG Steering Committee

1. Change History

This section will be removed when this document is published.

* 1. June 26, 2023

PWG Last Call Review Comment Resolutions:

* AS1: [PWG\_ROLES] was highlighted in 6.4
  + RESOLVED - replaced with cross reference to [PWG\_ROLES] bookmark.
* AS2: There is a bad reference in 6.5.1
  + RESOLVED - replaced with cross reference to [PWG\_MEMBER] bookmark.
* AS3: Bad link in Line 214 for "PWG Membership Agreement"
  + RESOLVED - copied the document to create the correct URL (<https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/process/pwg-membership-agreement-form.pdf>) and updated the URL
* AS4: [PWG\_COMM] is included in the Normative References in 11.1, but it is not referenced elsewhere within the body of Process 4.0
  + RESOLVED - added reference in section 8 and minor updates to text in section 8.
* AS5: [PWG\_ELECTION] is included in the Normative References in 11.1, but it is not referenced elsewhere within the body of Process 4.0
  + RESOLVED - removed
* AS6: [PWG\_MEMBER] is included in the Normative References in 11.1, but it is not referenced elsewhere within the body of Process 4.0
  + REJECTED - AS2 pointed to that so not removed.
* AS7: [PWG\_PROTOTYPE] is included in the Normative References in 11.1, but it is not referenced elsewhere within the body of Process 4.
  + RESOLVED - removed
* MS1: No front-matter showing copyright/etc. Probably want the white paper front matter.
  + RESOLVED - added
* MS2: References: I don't like the underscores in the names, and there is some inconsistency in the naming as well (PWG\_FOO vs PWGFOO vs. FOO) that is semi-confusing. My own preference would be "PWG-FOO" (dashes instead of underscores, PWG prefix) for all of the PWG document references.
  + RESOLVED - fixed to replace underscores with dashes, and added dashes and prefixes to normalize
* MS3: Section 6.2: Do we want to say anything about SC meetings/requirements as they relate to the legal organization (since there are legal requirements for the SC that are slightly different from the normal PWG IP/anti-trust policy stuff)?
  + RESOLVED - added paragraph to 6.2 in SC meeting 2023-06-26
* MS4: Section 6.3: Might be worth mentioning the reality of Co-Chairs vs. Chair/Vice-Chair and a Chair/Vice-Chair/Co-Chair also serving as Secretary?
  + RESOLVED - minor tweak to section 6.3 paragraph 2.
* MS5: Section 6.4: Do we want to leave open the possibility of experts for other standards organizations?
  + REJECTED - These roles are covered in [PWG-ROLES] and don't need coverage here.
* MS6: There doesn't seem to be a mention of liaisons - probably just as important as designated experts
  + REJECTED - These roles are covered in [PWG-ROLES] and don't need coverage here but added a new sentence in section 6.
* MS7: Section 6.5.1: Broken reference, does it need a sub-section?
  + RESOLVED - replaced with cross reference to [PWG\_MEMBER] bookmark.
* MS8: Section 6.5.2: This seems out-of-place given that the membership levels are defined elsewhere. Can this just be a note for section 6.5? (i.e. you can't vote if you haven't paid)
  + RESOLVED - left as is but added a reference to [PWG-MEMBERS].
* MS9: Section 7: Should we reference the IP and anti-trust policy?
  + REJECTED - it is mentioned in section 6.5 and in [PWG-MEETINGS].
* MS10: Section 8: Is there a document describing the communications infrastructure? Or should this document list the URLs for each of the mentioned high-level components?
  + RESOLVED - added reference in section 8 and minor updates to text in section 8.
* MS11: Section 9: Should we reference the IP policy since the published documents are copyrighted?
  + REJECTED - it is mentioned in section 6.5 and in [PWG-DOCS].
  1. May 1, 2023

Updated with approved policy document dates and links.

* 1. April 10, 2023

Minor updates to references to all highlighted normative references to policy documents that will soon enter SC Last Call.

* 1. March 30, 2023

Live edited:

* Modified definition of PWG Voting Member (agreed to keep Voting Member)
* Add PWG Voting Member to defined terms
* Added link to new PWG Membership Policy draft
  1. March 13, 2023

Updated to define "PWG Voting Members" from review of today's draft of PWG Document Management Policy.

* 1. January 9, 2023

Resolutions for Bill Wagner's feedback from SC Last Call:

* Rephrase sentence in section 3 to remove anthropomorphic elements;
* Rephrased some bits in subsections of section 3;
* Rephrase section 5 to remove discussion of document approval, but rather discuss the more general topic of Workgroup decision making; and
* Retitled Section 6.3 to be PWG Workgroups and moved the second paragraph to be the first.
  1. December 5, 2022

A couple of changes:

* Removed the reference to the PWG Communications Policy;
* Reviewed and updated links in the References section; and
* Added language to section 3.2 covering PWG Policy document lifecycle.
  1. November 28, 2022

Updated references as per feedback from Bill Wagner via email 11/21/22.

* 1. November 8, 2022

Updated during review in Steering Committee Tiger Team 2022-11-07.

* 1. November 4, 2022

A few changes in addition to editorial fixes:

* Updated section 1 to reflect the current document structure;
* Updated references;
* Removed section 13 "Plan" since the plan has now been executed; and
* Reworded section 10.1.

This draft is likely ready for wider distribution and review.

* 1. August 29, 2022

A few changes live editing in SC TT:

* Rewrote and approved section 3;
* Merged sections 4 and 5;
* Changed many instances of “process” to instead use “procedure”; and
* Added a short description of how PWG SC approves decisions to what is now section 6.2.
  1. August 23, 2022

Added back in the sections defining PWG Process and PWG Policy, and added a first draft of the processes used to approve them, which we decided belongs in this document, not the Document Management Policy.

* 1. May 28, 2022

Several changes:

* Updated the reference name for PWG Workgroup Decisions Policy
  1. May 13, 2022

Several changes:

* Fixed several references;
* Changed status to Stable; and
* Added “Overview of Changes” section.
  1. April 12, 2022

Major refactoring - moved the content from sections 3-6 and 8 to Policy documents. Added the "plan" in section 13. Need to migrate all of section 7 to PWG Officer Roles & Responsibilities Policy document in next revision.

* 1. December 6, 2021

Started at the top with the abstract, resolving issues and fixing text along the way. Stopped at section 3.1.

* 1. November 22, 2021

Cleaned up after several revisions were made where it wasn't clear whether we were editing text that was going to be kept or thrown away. New starting point.

* 1. May 24, 2021

Live editing sections 3 and 4. Then added in sections 3-7 from pwg-process-4.0-20210105.docx before the earlier section 3, which is now section 8 in this revision. Need to merge and homogenize the content.

* 1. April 26, 2021

Live editing section 3.

* 1. March 17, 2021

Updated with live editing from the Marcy 15, 2021 PWG Steering Committee Tiger Team review, removing and editing content starting at section 1.

* 1. January 6, 2021

Initial revision:

* + Content taken from PWG Process 3.0 (https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/pwg-process-30.pdf)
  + Whitepaper template used: https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/templates/white-template-20200604.docx
  + References, Terminology, Authors' Addresses and Change History sections added
  + Front page content on pages 2-3 was taken from a contribution by Mike Sweet, which is a modified version of the pages from the Working Draft Template
  + Substituted a reference to the membership web page for the membership categories table and discussion of the different categories